

Rationale for Increasing the Age for sale for tobacco in England from 18 to 21

Deborah Arnott, honorary associate professor, University of Nottingham and chief executive, Action on Smoking and Health

Professor Richard Ashcroft, Deputy Dean of the Law School at City, University of London

Kate Pike, Regional Co-ordinator, Trading Standards North West

Professor Robert West, Emeritus Professor, Behavioural Science and Health, University College London

Citation for this document: Arnott D, Ashcroft R, Pike K, West R. Rationale for Increasing the Age for sale for tobacco in England from 18 to 21. London: ASH, 2021.

Introduction

1. The uniquely harmful impact of tobacco and smoking, and a global recognition of the need for strict regulation, is enshrined in the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC). The treaty, which over 180 countries including the UK have committed to uphold, includes an obligation to restrict the supply of, and demand for, tobacco.
2. The UK is a world leader in implementation of the FCTC, having banned advertising, put tobacco out of sight in shops and required packaging to be standardised with large graphic health warnings, as well as providing help for smokers to quit and having high rates of taxation to reduce affordability. However, policy measures already in place have not been sufficient to end smoking, and youth uptake remains a significant problem.¹
3. As Parties to the FCTC we are encouraged to implement measures beyond those required by the FCTC and its protocols.² Increasing the age of sale, as part of a comprehensive tobacco control strategy, is an important policy measure which can help deliver a smokefree generation and a Smokefree society by 2030 in line with the ambition of our government, supported by the public, and civil society.
4. Tobacco manufacturers recognised the importance of this age group, to quote Philip Morris (1986)³ *“Raising the legal minimum age for cigarette purchaser to 21 could gut our key young adult market (17-20) ...”* But we need to do more than show that tobacco companies believed it would damage their business, to prove that increasing the age of sale for tobacco from 18 to 21 (T21) is justified. Key questions to be answered are:
 - Is it ethical?
 - Is it needed?
 - Is it wanted?
 - Is it workable?

Is it ethical?

5. Increasing the age of sale is not about criminalising smoking, it is about restricting access, making it illegal for an adult to *sell* cigarettes to, or procure cigarettes for, young people under the age of sale.
6. Examined on its own merits, it is proportionate to increase the age of sale to 21, because of the unique harm caused by smoking. Tobacco is the only legal consumer product which kills when

used as intended, causing the death of more than 200 people a day in the UK.⁴ Consequently, smoking requires a unique regulatory response to minimise the burden of preventable death and disease it inflicts on society. Smoking is addictive and uniquely harmful and increasing the age of sale would reduce uptake and so save thousands of lives.

7. According to the 2012 Surgeon General's Report, *"Of every 3 young smokers, only 1 will quit, and 1 of those remaining smokers will die from tobacco-related causes."*⁵ On average, cigarette smokers die 5 years younger than non-smokers, 10 years for lifelong smokers. Additionally, for every person who dies because of smoking, 30 people are living with a serious smoking-related illness.^{6 7}
8. Tobacco dependence is an addictive disorder that typically starts before the brain has matured, with the vast majority of smokers starting before the age of 21 and with substantial uptake between 18 and 20 years. Between 2014 and 2018 around 1 in 5 young people had ever smoked by the age of 18, while an additional 1 in 10 young adults had ever smoked between the ages of 18 and 20. (Ever smokers are people who are currently smokers or who have ever smoked regularly for a year or more.)¹
9. Surveys show that 69% of adult smokers in England want to quit and an even bigger proportion, 75%, regret ever having started smoking.⁸ Of every young person who tries smoking two thirds will go on to become regular smokers.⁹ In 2020 slightly more than one in three smokers in England tried to quit.¹ Relapsing back to smoking is common and on average it takes smokers 30 attempts before they successfully quit.¹⁰
10. Legal arguments that smoking is a "human right" have failed in the English and Scottish courts.¹¹^{12 13} On the proportionality of regulations requiring plain standardised packaging, the judgement concluded that, *"there is a significant moral angle which is embedded in the Regulations which is about saving children from a lifetime of addiction, and children and adults from premature death and related suffering and disease. I therefore reject the Claimants' case that the Regulations are disproportionate."* [Para 36 page 22]¹⁴

18 is not a fixed age at which a child becomes an adult

11. Adolescence and young adulthood is a period of cognitive, psychosocial, neurobiological, and physical development, all of which heighten the risks of tobacco initiation, continued use, and dependence.¹⁵ And this is not just about smoking. It is now accepted that the late teens through the early 20s (ages approximately 18 to 26) are a distinct period of life known as young adulthood, where young people may still need support and protection. For example statutory provision in England in terms of social care for care leavers has been extended in recent years from 18 to 25.¹⁶
12. The idea that at 18 one automatically acquires the full set of all rights possessed by all adults is factually incorrect: there are already exceptions. Activities prohibited to under 21s include adopting a child, driving a large passenger vehicle or heavy goods vehicle, and supervising a learner driver.¹⁷
13. The previous increase in the age of sale from 16 to 18 did not result in a corresponding increase to the age limit for other activities which are allowed at 16 or 17 years of age. These include getting married, joining the armed forces, consenting to lawful sexual intercourse, and holding a driving licence,¹⁷ and 16 is also the age of majority for consent to medical treatment.¹⁸

Is it needed?

14. Introduction of what in the US is called T21 (Tobacco 21) spread rapidly in US states followed publication in 2015 of a report by the Institute of Medicine¹⁹ (IoM), commissioned by the Food and Drugs Administration. This concluded that increasing the age of sale to 21 would “lead to substantial reductions in smoking prevalence and thereby prevent considerable numbers of smoking-attributable deaths, including lung cancer deaths, and poor maternal and child health outcomes.”, while increasing still further to 25 would be likely to be considerably smaller. In December 2019 the US Government instituted 21 years as the minimum age of sale by Federal law.
15. The evidence from the US is that raising the age of sale from 18 to 21 has reduced smoking prevalence in that age group by at least 30%.^{20 21} This is very similar to the impact when the age of sale in England was increased from 16 to 18 in 2007. This led to a reduction of 30% in smoking prevalence in people aged 16 and 17 years, partly by reducing uptake and partly by promoting cessation,²² and had a sustained impact.²³ Our calculations of the impact in England of T21 are therefore based on the assumption that it would lead to a 30% drop in smoking rates in that age range in the first year.
16. A Department of Health analysis for the Tobacco Control Plan 2017 of the 2014 Health Survey for England found that around three quarters of young smokers aged 16 to 24 had started smoking before the age of 18, which means that a quarter had started aged 18 or over.²⁴
17. Around 364,000 young people between the age of 18 and 20 currently smoke in England and around 59,000 take up smoking in that age range each year.²⁵ It is estimated that implementation of T21 would lead to a reduction in the number of smokers from 364,000 to 255,000 in year one. An estimated 54,500 of these would have lost an average 5 years life expectancy, ten years if they carried on smoking for all their lives.²⁶ After year one 18,000 new smokers a year would be prevented. Together this would create a significant reduction in smoking prevalence which would move through the age cohorts over time.
18. These calculations were based on conservative assumptions that the effect on cessation would only occur in year one, in subsequent years the impact would only be on uptake; and there would be no impact on smoking behaviour outside the age range 18 to 20. It should be noted that the IoM concluded that if the age of sale were increased to 21 “the largest proportionate reduction in the initiation of tobacco use will likely occur among adolescents 15 to 17 years old.” The rationale for this was that smoking is a contagious habit, and the age increase will protect younger children from exposure to older pupils in school who smoke and whose behaviour they may want to imitate. The gap will also remove a potential source of supply within schools.^{27 28 29}
19. The IoM investigation also concluded there would be additional benefits from the ‘declarative’ effect of T21, which would help to change norms about the acceptability of smoking, although this might take time. And last but not least that it would lead to a reduction in smoking rates among young mothers, who are the age cohort most likely to smoke during pregnancy, with immediate benefits to the health and wellbeing of both babies and the unborn child.
20. Smoking during pregnancy is the leading modifiable risk factor for poor birth outcomes including stillbirth, miscarriage, and sudden infant death. Just under a third of pregnant women in England aged under 20 smoking at their booking appointment and delivery, compared to around one in

ten pregnant women overall.³⁰ As well as being more likely to smoke in the first place, younger mothers were less likely to quit before or during pregnancy.

Is it wanted?

21. The Government's Smokefree 2030 ambition is supported by 76% of the English population in a large public opinion survey of over 10,000 adults, backed up by high levels of support for a wide range of government action.³¹ Increasing the age of sale from 18 to 21 has majority support from adults (63% support 15% oppose), including those aged 18-24 who would be most affected by this policy (54% support 24% oppose) and 11-18 year olds (59% support 14% oppose).³² It's a popular policy with voters for all the major political parties with two thirds of Conservative voters saying they support raising the age of sale to 21 (66% support 12% oppose).³¹
22. Support for tobacco regulations grows after measures are implemented, particularly among smokers. In 2015, after the law was passed prohibiting smoking in cars carrying children but before it was implemented, only 40% of smokers supported the legislation. A year later, after it had come into effect, it was supported by 74% of smokers.³³
23. Raising the age of sale to 21 is also popular among small retailers, with 52% of over 500 independent tobacco retailers surveyed in 2019 saying they supported the policy, compared to 39% who opposed.³⁴

Is it workable?

24. An innovative new policy like this would need a public consultation, and comprehensive communication to retailers before being implemented. The lesson from Smokefree laws is that such public consultation helps raise awareness and make a policy like this, which requires public support to succeed, much easier to enforce when it is implemented. A review of the first year of implementation of the smokefree laws in England³⁵ found that:
 - 98% of all premises and vehicles inspected in the first 9 months were smokefree, complying with the requirements of the law.
 - 87% of all premises and vehicles are displaying the correct no-smoking signage.
 - 81% of business decision makers thought the law was 'a good idea'.
25. Increasing the age of sale would not increase the difficulty of enforcement, particularly if the legislation is backed up by other regulatory changes which would make the tobacco enforcement work of trading standards officers easier such as:
 - Giving powers to trading standards officers to issue on the spot fines.
 - Introduction of mandatory 'Challenge 25' regulations for all Age Restricted products as is the case in Scotland.³⁶ Retailers in England are encouraged to implement this voluntarily, but that allows for inconsistencies which undermine its effectiveness as a compliance and enforcement tool.
 - All retailers required to have a licence which can be removed if they are found selling illicit tobacco or making underage sales.
26. The majority of independent tobacco retailers already support increasing the age of sale to 21 which will help ensure compliance. Independent tobacco retailers are also strongly supportive of strengthening Challenge 21 and Challenge 25 schemes (net agree 78%, net disagree 14%) and

71% strongly agreed on having a tobacco licence which could be removed if retailers break the law (net agree 84%, net disagree 9%, neither agree/disagree or don't know 7%).³⁷

27. Other complementary legislative changes would be required including prohibiting proxy purchase of tobacco for smokers under 21, and considering the prohibition of staff under 21 from selling tobacco (as with the current requirement in Scotland for sales by under 18-year-olds).

Conclusion

The smoking epidemic is a unique historical phenomenon. It had a beginning, and it needs to be brought to an end. We do not need to argue that there is something specific to 21 in relation to tobacco in order to establish a case for moving toward a smokefree generation. We need only to show that raising the minimum age for tobacco purchase to 21 is proportionate, will be effective, and does not breach any basic human rights. It is clear that it passes all three tests.

References accessed May 2021

¹ Smoking Toolkit Study data. [Monthly household surveys of representative samples of approximately 1800 adults \(16+ years old\) in England](#). UCL.

² World Health Organization (WHO). [WHO FRAMEWORK CONVENTION ON TOBACCO CONTROL \(FCTC\) - Article 2](#). 2005.

³ Morris, Philip. (1986, January 21). [Discussion Draft Sociopolitical Strategy](#). Bates no. 2043440040-2043440049.

⁴ Office for National Statistics (ONS). [Adult smoking habits in the UK: 2019](#). July 2020

⁵ U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. [Preventing Tobacco Use Among Youth and Young Adults: A Report of the Surgeon General](#). Atlanta, GA: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, 2012.

⁶ Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). [Smoking and Tobacco Use. Fast Facts. Diseases and Deaths](#). 2020.

⁷ U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. [The Health Consequences of Smoking: 50 Years of Progress](#). A Report of the Surgeon General. Atlanta, GA: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, 2014. Printed with corrections, January 2014.

⁸ National sample of 3,717 adult smokers in England (18+ years) who participated in a web-conducted survey undertaken between March and June 2018. International Tobacco Control (ITC) Project: 29 countries.

⁹ Birge M, Duffy S, Miler JA, Hajek P. [What proportion of people who try one cigarette become daily smokers? A meta-analysis of representative surveys](#). *Nicotine Tob Res.* 2018 Nov 15;20(12):1427-1433. doi: 10.1093/ntr/ntx243 PMID: 29126298.

¹⁰ Chaiton M, Diemert L, Cohen JE, Bondy SJ, Selby P, Philipneri A, Schwartz R. [Estimating the number of quit attempts it takes to quit smoking successfully in a longitudinal cohort of smokers](#). *BMJ Open.* 2016 Jun 9;6(6):e011045. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2016-011045. PMID: 27288378; PMCID: PMC4908897.

¹¹ Royal Courts of Justice. [England and Wales Highcourt \(Administrative Court Decisions\). Neutral Citation Number: \[2008\] EWHC 1096 \(Admin\)](#). Date: May 20, 2008

¹² Mental Health Law Online. [R \(G\) v Nottinghamshire Healthcare NHS](#). 2009

¹³ Scottish Legal News. [Blanket ban on smoking in mental health hospitals declared 'lawful'](#). 2018

-
- ¹⁴Royal Courts Justice. [England and Wales High Court \(Administrative Court\) Decisions.Tobacco Packaging. Neutral Citation Number: \[2016\] EWHC 1169 \(Admin\). Date: May 19, 2016.](#)
- ¹⁵IOM and NRC (Institute of Medicine and National Research Council). [Investing in the health and well-being of young adults.](#) Bonnie RJ, Stroud C, Breiner H, editors. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press; 2014
- ¹⁶Child Law Advice. [Services for children leaving care.](#)
- ¹⁷Law Stuff. [At What Age Timeline.](#)
- ¹⁸NHS. [Children and young people - Consent to treatment.](#) March 2019.
- ¹⁹Bonnie RJ, Stratton K, Kwan LY, editors. [Public health implications of raising the minimum age of legal access to tobacco products.](#) Washington, DC: National Academies Press; 2015 Jul 23.
- ²⁰Friedman AS, Buckell J, Sindelar JL. [Tobacco-21 laws and young adult smoking: quasi-experimental evidence.](#) *Addiction.* 2019 Oct;114(10):1816-23.
- ²¹Friedman AS, Wu RJ. [Do local tobacco-21 laws reduce smoking among 18 to 20 year-olds?](#) *Nicotine and Tobacco Research.* 2020 Jul;22(7):1195-201.
- ²²Fidler JA, West R. [Changes in smoking prevalence in 16-17-year-old versus older adults following a rise in legal age of sale: findings from an English population study.](#) *Addiction.* 2010 Nov;105(11):1984-8. doi: 10.1111/j.1360-0443.2010.03039.x. Epub 2010 Aug 17. PMID: 20722633.
- ²³Beard, Emma, Jamie Brown, Sarah Jackson, Robert West, Will Anderson, Deborah Arnott, and Lion Shahab. [Long-term evaluation of the rise in legal age-of-sale of cigarettes from 16 to 18 in England: a trend analysis.](#) *BMC Med* **18**, 85 (2020). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12916-020-01541-w>
- ²⁴Department of Health. [Towards a smokefree generation: tobacco control plan for England,](#) 18 July 2017.
- ²⁵Beard E, Brown J, Jackson SE, West R, Anderson W, Arnott D, Shahab L. [Who would be targeted by increasing the legal age of sale of cigarettes from 18 to 21?](#) A cross-sectional study exploring the number and characteristics of smokers in England. *Addiction.* 2021 Feb 10.
- ²⁶Doll R, Peto R, Wheatley K, Gray R, Sutherland I. [Mortality in relation to smoking: 40 years' observations on male British doctors.](#) *Bmj.* 1994 Oct 8;309(6959):901-11. doi: 10.1136/bmj.309.6959.901. PMID: 7755693; PMCID: PMC2541142.
- ²⁷NHS Digital. [Smoking, drinking and drug use among young people in England: 2014.](#) July 2015.
- ²⁸Laverty AA, Filippidis FT, Taylor-Robinson D, Millett C, Bush A, Hopkinson NS. [Smoking uptake in UK children: analysis of the UK Millennium Cohort Study.](#) *Thorax.* 2019 Jun 1;74(6):607-10.
- ²⁹Hopkinson Nicholas S. [Keep out of reach of children—the case for increasing the legal age for tobacco purchase to 21](#) *BMJ* 2019; 364 :l1330
- ³⁰NHS Digital. [National Maternity Statistics 2017-18.](#) 2018
- ³¹All figures, unless otherwise stated, are from YouGov Plc. Total sample size was 10,211 adults. Fieldwork was undertaken between 18th February - 18th March 2021. The survey was carried out online. The figures have been weighted and are representative of all English adults (aged 18+).
- ³²All figures, unless otherwise stated, are from YouGov Plc. Total sample size was 2513 children aged 11 to 18. Fieldwork was undertaken between 25th March - 16th April 2021. The survey was carried out online. Results have been weighted and are representative of GB children aged 11 to 18.
- ³³ASH. [Smokefree: The First Ten Years, Tackling the smoking epidemic in England: the views of the public.](#) July 2017
- ³⁴NEMS survey for ASH. Computer assisted telephone interviews were conducted between the 6th and 21st August 2019. Interviewees were owners or managers of these small shops. 558 retailers were interviewed, around half were convenience stores or local supermarkets, but respondents also included off-licences, newsagents, petrol stations, and tobacconists.
- ³⁵Department of Health. [Smokefree England – one year on.](#)
- ³⁶Legislation.gov.uk. [Health \(Tobacco, Nicotine etc. and Care\) \(Scotland\) Act 2016.](#)
- ³⁷ASH and Breathe2025 [response to Advancing our health: prevention in the 2020s.](#) 2019